"By the Code of Humanity":
Ralph Carr Takes a Stand for Japanese-American Rights During World War II

Stephanie Reitzig

Niwot High School
2017 National Champion
2017 Theme: Taking a Stand in History

Stephanie Reitzig is a first-year student at the University of Chicago. She recently graduated from Niwot High School, where she participated in the International Baccalaureate Diploma Program. She competed in National History Day three times, most recently in 2017, when she was awarded first place in the Senior Paper category at the national level. In writing about Carr, Reitzig hoped to spread awareness of his principled stand for Japanese-American rights and its impact on Colorado during World War II and beyond.

“The world’s great melting pot is peopled by the descendants of every nation in the globe. It is not fair for the rest of us to segregate people from one or two or three nations and to brand them as unpatriotic or disloyal regardless.... Let it be understood that such conduct is not approved by the code of humanity.”

-Ralph Carr
Radio Address, February 28, 1942

On February 19, 1942, President Franklin Delano Roosevelt issued Executive Order 9066, stating that, “the right of any person to enter, remain in, or leave [areas prescribed by the Secretary of War] shall be subject to whatever restrictions the Secretary... may impose.”¹ The order caused Japanese Americans (Nisei) on the West Coast to be forcibly relocated to internment camps for much of World War II, stripping thousands of their liberties and livelihoods.² Yet as suspicion “of any person of Japanese ancestry” swept the United States, one elected official steadfastly refused to be influenced by the bigotry, hysteria, and growing panic. He was Ralph Carr, the twenty-ninth governor of Colorado and the only governor who said he would willingly accept Japanese Americans in his state, thereby taking a stand for their rights during World War II.³ Though this stand eventually cost Carr his career, it profoundly influenced minority rights in the United States, with a legacy that continues today. His actions not only enabled many Japanese Americans to avoid the devastating impact of internment, but also helped to bring internment to an end by bolstering the voices of those who opposed it. Carr’s affirmation of minorities’ constitutional freedoms renewed Colorado’s commitment to protecting citizens’ rights and left a lasting impact on his state.

Hysteria after Pearl Harbor
Ralph Carr had neither expected, nor wanted, to be governor. Born December 11, 1887, in Rosita, Colorado, he had worked since the age of six to support his family before attending the University of Colorado for his undergraduate and law degrees.⁴ He would later attribute his views on racial equality to his upbringing in Rosita, declaring of his stance on Japanese American internment, “I was brought up in a small town where I knew the shame and dishonor of race hatred. I grew to despise it because it threatened the happiness of you and you and you.”⁵

In 1929, President Herbert Hoover appointed Carr U.S. attorney for Colorado. While serving in this position, Carr reluctantly launched his 1938 gubernatorial campaign at the behest of Colorado Republicans.⁶ Having become the public’s favorite politician for his plan to repair the state’s tattered finances, Carr won by 49,000 votes in 1938 and was reelected by a margin of 51,000 votes in 1940.⁷

As governor, much of his work dealt with water rights, which in Colorado’s arid climate were vital to the agricultural economy.⁸ This work later informed his stance on Japanese internment, as fighting the proposed Arkansas Valley Authority...
(AVA) in 1938 enabled Carr to understand the power of precedent in shaping constitutional interpretations. The Tennessee Valley Authority (TVA), created in 1933 to provide electricity and flood control to the Tennessee Valley, had generated significant public support. Amid faltering judicial and public approval of the New Deal years later, federal officials devised the similar AVA, which would have nationalized control over Western water rights. Carr worked to prevent this federal program from passing after discovering that its authors had yet to visit the region, and were using the TVA to rapidly pass the AVA. Opposing the proposed bill gave him crucial insight into the power of precedent, which he would later express when warning of the dangerous example set by internment.

Carr was at the midpoint of his second term as governor when the Japanese struck Pearl Harbor on December 7, 1941. Congress quickly responded with a declaration of war on December 8. As the country prepared for conflict, shocked Americans panicked at the possibility of saboteurs aiding Japan from within the United States. One man wrote Carr to describe how Japanese students at the Colorado School of Mines in Golden “took pictures and many notes” while visiting a local mine, adding that “the productive capacity of the Axis could be due to the fact the Axis [powers] are applying my Geological [sic] data in their mining operations.” Politicians’ increasing tendency to treat Japanese-American citizens as foreigners augmented hysteria, such as when General John DeWitt declared that “a Jap’s a Jap… whether the Jap is a citizen or not.”

Public sentiment and the popular press overwhelmingly supported the incarceration of Japanese Americans. On February 18, 1942, for example, one Colorado newspaper editor endorsed Pulitzer Prize winner Westbrook Pegler’s view that “the Japanese in California should be under armed guard to the last man and woman right now and to hell with habeas corpus until the danger is over.” Government leaders evidently felt the same way. One day later, President Roosevelt issued Executive Order 9066. The order outraged Carr, who vehemently believed that all American citizens, regardless of race or ethnicity, should be guaranteed their constitutional rights. Violation of these freedoms seemed increasingly inevitable, however, with reports emerging that Japanese Americans would soon be relocated to internment camps. As rumors spread of the possibility of such camps in Colorado, Coloradans grew furious at the idea of having “yellow devils” in their state. Many threatened violence towards Japanese Americans, with a report from the Immigration and Naturalization Service describing how one man planned to go “Jap hunting” if internees arrived.

Given this escalating tension, Carr felt it more imperative than ever that he firmly express the state’s official stance on Japanese internment. On February 28, 1942, he delivered a radio address to establish Colorado’s twofold position on the subject. First, if the federal government determined that Japanese immigrants (Issei) deemed dangerous to the war effort should be imprisoned in the state; “then we of Colorado are big enough and patriotic enough to do our duty” without objecting merely because of Coloradans’ racial bias. Despite this, Colorado would neither endorse these camps nor offer military support for them. Second, and most importantly, Carr differentiated in his radio address between interning supposedly dangerous enemy aliens and imprisoning American citizens in violation of their constitutional rights. He further denounced discrimination against immigrants and their families, reminding listeners, “In Colorado there are thousands of men and women and children… who by reason of blood only, are regarded by some people as unfriendly…. [Many] are American citizens, with no connection with or feeling of loyalty toward the customs and philosophies of Italy, Japan, or Germany.” As he concluded his speech, Carr stressed the ethical cost of violence.
against such people. Intolerance and discrimination, he declared, are "not approved by the code of humanity."

**Affirming Japanese-American Rights**

Reactions to Carr’s stance came swiftly, as illustrated by the flood of angry letters he received following his address. One Coloradan instructed Carr to "regard this letter as a vigorous protest against any of those damned Japs being sent to this state;" while another told him that “those yellow rats… breed like termites and can be trusted less.” Many demanded a stance like that of Wyoming’s governor, who threatened, “If you bring Japanese into my state, I promise you they will be hanging from every tree.” Among Western state leaders, only Carr refused to make similar declarations.

Carr also received hundreds of pleas from Japanese Americans seeking to move to Colorado before relocation was implemented. He responded to each with a copy of his message to US military commander Herman Goebel, in which he reaffirmed Japanese Americans’ constitutional freedoms and stated that "no Governor has the right to deny to any American citizen or to any other person living in the country legally the right to enter or to reside in or to cross his state." He reiterated this position in his responses to angry constituents, reminding them, "Do not think that injustice should be visited upon the innocent because of misconduct of individuals." Carr further reinforced this commitment to Japanese-American rights when he halted passage of a 1942 state bill revoking Japanese Americans’ citizenship in Colorado.

This affirmation of Japanese-American rights had an enormous impact. Terrified of being forcibly relocated to internment camps, many Japanese Americans decided to flee the West Coast before interment was officially imposed on March 1, 1942. Because of Carr’s nondiscriminatory and benevolent stance, Colorado became one of their most common destinations. By June 8, 1942, 1,605 people of Japanese descent, seventy percent of them American citizens, had already fled to the state.

These refugees narrowly escaped the devastating impacts of interment. Internees suffered irrecoverable economic losses, as financial opportunists purchased evacuees’ possessions at a fraction of their worth. Property left in storage was often stolen or vandalized, and escheatment proceedings, in which the state seized unworked land, were frequently begun against interned farmers, many of whom were paid only around one-tenth of the land’s true value. The human costs of internment far exceeded this. Jeanne Wakatsuki Houston, who authored along with her husband, *Farewell to Manzanar*, recalled that due to interment, her family “collapsed as an integrated unit. Whatever dignity or feeling of filial strength we may have known before December 1941 was lost.” The distrust and lack of freedom that pervaded internment took an enormous psychological toll on internees, many of whom began to work through the emotional harms of their experiences only several decades after internment ended. Ted Nagata described the impacts of internment on his mother stating that “the stress of incarceration… affected her to the point where she couldn’t carry on.” By enabling Japanese Americans to avoid internment by migrating to Colorado before relocation officially took effect, Carr saved some two thousand refugees from suffering adverse consequences, and safeguarded their rights and livelihoods.

**Carr’s Lasting Legacy**

One letter-writer related to Carr how she and her husband "scarcely hear anything but this: ‘If Governor Carr lets the Japs in here, well, that’s the end of his political career in Colorado.’" Yet let them in he did, and as predicted, the action doomed his political career. In 1942, he ran for the Senate, facing incumbent Ed Johnson. Johnson made Carr’s opposition to internment the main issue in the race, painting Carr as an enemy of national unity. Unsurprisingly, Carr lost the race, albeit by a narrow margin.

Carr’s effect on minority rights continued long after his time in government. This came in part from the powerful publicity he had attracted as an elected official protesting Japanese-American internment. Carr received not only thousands of protest letters, but also letters of support, with one man declaring that "no Governor of our great state ever spoke to the people with greater patriotism, Americanism, and valor than you." However, the voices of those who stood with Carr were drowned out by those of the majority. Gallup polls from 1942 found that seventy-three percent of Americans believed the Japanese to be "treacherous" while sixty-three percent believed them to be "sly." By December 1942, only thirty-five percent of Americans believed that relocated
Japanese Americans should be allowed to return to their homes after the war. Public figures, such as Earl Warren, the state attorney general and then governor of California, strongly endorsed internment, and as a result people heard few voices advocating for Japanese-American rights. Carr’s opposition to internment of Japanese Americans made headlines across the country, with his position as an elected official forcing both journalists and politicians to acknowledge Japanese-American internment’s constitutional violations. This heightened national consciousness is evident in the propaganda film, *A Challenge to Democracy*, produced in 1944 by the War Relocation Authority (WRA), which carried out the internment of Japanese and Japanese Americans. While an earlier companion film failed to mention constitutional concerns, *A Challenge to Democracy* directly responded to them, claiming that internment was only a temporary step in the relocation of Japanese Americans, “so there can be no question of the constitutionality of any part of the actions taken by the government to meet the dangers of war [and] no law-abiding American need to fear for his own freedom.”

Facilitated in great part by Carr’s stance and its resulting publicity, this increased consciousness of Japanese-American internment’s constitutional violations led to its termination in December 1944. Dillon Myer, the former head of the WRA, recounted that the organization decided to end internment before the war concluded specifically in response to increasing public consciousness of internment’s unconstitutionality. Carr’s stand for Japanese-American rights and the publicity it garnered thus hastened the decision to end internment, further demonstrating the profound influence that Carr’s position had for Japanese Americans.

Yet Carr’s impact on minority rights stretched far beyond these tangible effects. His stand for Japanese-American rights advanced Colorado as a diverse state protective of its American citizens, regardless of race or ethnicity. Many Japanese Americans who had fled the West Coast and were inspired to stay in Colorado by the humanness shown to them by Carr established a thriving Japanese-American community in Denver after the war. Additionally, Carr’s emphasis on guaranteeing all citizens their constitutional rights gave Coloradans a firm reminder of the values of equality and justice upon which the United States was founded, as demonstrated when Colorado voters soundly defeated a 1944 measure to prohibit Japanese land ownership.

Today reminders of Carr’s legacy abound in the state. Carr is the only Colorado governor to be memorialized in three places in Denver: the State Capitol, Sakura Square, and, most significantly in the Ralph Carr Judicial Center. Additionally, the “Ralph Carr Freedom Defense Act,” a bill proposed to the Colorado General Assembly in early 2017, reaffirms Colorado’s commitment to protecting citizens, regardless of race, ethnicity, or religion. By taking a stand for Japanese-American rights, Carr impressed upon Coloradans the importance of defending the constitutional freedoms of each citizen, and established Colorado as a state that protects citizens’ rights.

**Living “by the Cody of Humanity”**

In 1950, Colorado Republicans persuaded Carr to run for a third term as governor. Sadly, he died halfway through his campaign on September 23, 1950, from complications from diabetes. In 1976, local Japanese Americans erected a bust of Carr in Denver’s Sakura Square, accompanied by a plaque affirming that “the precious democratic
ideals he espoused must forever be defended against prejudice and neglect.\textsuperscript{44}

This espousal of the constitutional rights of all Americans, regardless of race or ethnicity, had profound implications for minority rights in the United States. Carr believed in Japanese Americans’ loyalty. He did not send Japanese Coloradans to the internment camps, including Granada Relocation Center, known as “Amache.” He believed that the Constitution should protect all Americans.\textsuperscript{45} In addition to enabling thousands of Japanese Americans to avoid the adverse consequences of internment by welcoming them to Colorado before relocation took effect, Carr bolstered the voices of those who opposed Japanese-American internment and thus contributed to the decision to end internment prior to the war’s conclusion. Carr established Colorado as a state committed to protecting citizens’ rights, thereby influencing policy to the present day. This stand for Japanese-American rights amidst the fear and panic of World War II proved that Carr was a man of his convictions, who not only espoused, but also lived “by the code of humanity.”
Endnotes

“By the Code of Humanity”: Ralph Carr Takes a Stand for Japanese-American Rights During World War II
Stephanie Reitzig

2 Michael McCon, introduction to Executive Order 9066 (Burbank: Fremont Press, 1992), 9.
5 Quoted in Reeves, Infamy, 99.
7 “New Governor,” Craig Empire Courier (Craig, CO), Nov. 9, 1938; Abstract of Votes Cast (Denver: Bradford-Robinson, 1940), 9.
8 Schrager, The Principled Politician, 65.
11 Schrager, The Principled Politician, 81.
13 George Gillespie to Ralph Carr, February 28, 1942, Carr Collection, Colorado State Archives.
15 C.A. Stoddard, editorial, Craig Empire Courier (Craig, CO), Feb 18, 1942.
16 Schrager, The Principled Politician, 133.
17 Neil West Kimball, Short Miscellany, “Steamboat Plot (Steamboat Springs, CO), March 5, 1942.
18 Fred D. Fleming to Ralph Carr, Feb. 24, 1942, Carr Collection, Colorado State Archives.
19 Ralph L. Carr, radio address, Feb. 28, 1942.
20 George King to Ralph Carr, March 2, 1942, Carr Collection, Colorado State Archives; anonymous to Ralph Carr, Carr Collection, Colorado State Archives.
21 Quoted in Reeves, Infamy, 98.
23 Ralph Carr to Herman P. Goebel, Jr., July 2, 1942, Carr Collection, Colorado State Archives.
24 Ralph Carr to Kathryn Mowe and Mildred E. Mowe, April 1, 1942, Carr Collection, Colorado State Archives
26 E.L. Reilly to Ralph Carr, June 12, 1942, Carr Collection, Colorado State Archives.
27 Donald Pike and Roger Olmstead, introduction to Executive Order 9066 (Burbank: Fremont Press, 1992), 22-23.
29 Don T. Nakanishi. Introduction to Executive Order 9066 (Burbank: Fremont Press, 1992), 11.
31 Hannah A. Steele to Ralph Carr, Feb. 18, 1942, Carr Collection, Colorado State Archives.
33 Schrager, The Principled Politician, 305.
34 Lee Everett Minton to Ralph Carr, March 1, 1942, Carr Collection, Colorado State Archives.
37 Robinson, *By Order of the President*, 126.
Works Cited

“By the Code of Humanity”: Ralph Carr Takes a Stand for Japanese-American Rights During World War II
Stephanie Reitzig

Primary Sources
Carr, Ralph L. Radio address, Denver, CO, Feb. 28, 1942.
"Gov. Carr Stakes Political Future on His Jap Stand." Denver Post (Denver, CO), April 3, 1942.
"Inaugurated." Aspen Daily Times (Aspen, CO), Jan. 6, 1941.
Kimball, Neil West. "Short Miscellany." Steamboat Pilot (Steamboat Springs, CO), March 5, 1942.
"New Governor." Craig Empire Courier (Craig, CO), Nov. 9, 1938.
Stoddard, C.A. Editorial. Craig Empire Courier (Craig, CO), Feb. 18, 1942.

Secondary Sources

Photos & Images

The Marble March:
Octavius Thurinus’ Stand to Found an Empire
Jeremiah Ravenscroft

Primary Sources
Eutropius. Abridgement of Roman History; Book VII. Rev. John Shelby Watson, George Bell and Sons, London, 1886.